

**APPENDIX 3: EVALUATION MATRIX**  
(Evaluation against the 10 pre-determined criteria)

**RED:** Criteria not met, **AMBER:** Criteria partly met, **GREEN:** Criteria fully met

	Criteria	Option 1:		Option 3
		As an ALMO	Take back in House	Stock Transfer
1	Secure appropriate investment to fund property and external environmental investment works, i.e. stock improvements, car parking provision, property and estate security improvements	Would not secure the necessary investment to deliver the stock condition survey requirements nor in the time required.	As per the ALMO option	This can deliver all the works outlined in the Stock Condition Survey, including the environmental improvements and potentially even more
2	Regenerate and rejuvenate our neighbourhoods	Can have the aspiration to assist the Council and would not have any additional funding to undertake major estate regeneration.	Would not have any additional financing available, however could continue with models used in Hardwick and Mandale	Would be in a position to assist the Council with neighbourhood regeneration. Could be part of the objectives of the Association. Can include funding within the Business Plan to meet the agreed objectives.
3	Meet the housing needs of the Borough (improve and increase the supply of affordable housing options for our tenants and residents).	Although rules have changed to allow building to take place, will not have funding available.	Council has enabling role rather than being a developer although some relaxations of rules. Unlikely to have sufficient funds available	Would be in a position to develop new housing but would be limited to the funding that was available and what could be delivered through the Business Plan and agreed at transfer.
4	Meet the key national and local agendas (i.e. social inclusion, economic regeneration and the 'green agenda')	Can have aspirations towards contributing towards these issues but will not have additional funding to do so	Is key player in delivering these agendas locally but will not have additional funding to do so	Can ensure that contributing towards these issues are included within its objectives and appropriate funding be included within the Business Plan to allow it to assist the Council
5	Rents to provide value for money (for both new and existing tenants).	Rents will be set in the same way as the others but current level of services would be reduced	As for the ALMO retention	Rents will be set in the same way as the others but more services and improvements can be guaranteed

	Criteria	Option 1:		Option 3
		As an ALMO	Take back in House	Stock Transfer
6	Tenants rights to be protected.	Tenants' rights would remain exactly the same as now unless there were statutory changes	As for the ALMO retention	Tenants' rights would be protected as part of their Tenancy Agreement which tenants would be involved in drafting. However Right to Manage cannot be contractually protected although Association would be positive should tenants want to pursue
7	Provide a 'local' management and presence.	As for Stock Transfer	As for Stock Transfer	Association can commit to having local offices, Board members, etc., within Offer to Tenants. Can include such things as "use local labour" in contractors appointments etc.
8	Ensure good communication structures with tenants.	Can have as ethos for the organisation. Having tenant Board members would focus this attitude. Unlikely to be able to divert funding.	Could meet tenants' expectations, tenants would be consulted however ultimate decision-making remains with members. Unlikely to be able to divert funding	Would be built into Association from the start, part of its ethos. Having tenant Board members would focus this attitude and funding could be included within the Business Plan
9	Deliver opportunities for 'real' tenant involvement, participation and influence at all levels	Can have as ethos for the organisation. Having tenant Board members would focus this attitude. Unlikely to be able to divert funding.	Can be part of the ethos however unlikely to be able to divert funding.	Would be built into Association from the start, part of its ethos. Having tenant Board members would focus this attitude and funding could be included within the Business Plan
10	Ensure continuous service and quality improvement.	Can have as ethos for the organisation. Would not have the funding available to deliver the level of improvements aspired to by tenants.	As for the ALMO retention	Would be built into Association from the start, part of its ethos and funding could be included within the Business Plan

**RED:** Criteria not met, **AMBER:** Criteria partly met, **GREEN:** Criteria fully met

	<b>Criteria</b>	<b>Option 4: PFI</b>	<b>Option 5: Regeneration Delivery Vehicle</b>
1	Secure appropriate investment to fund property and external environmental investment works, i.e. stock improvements, car parking provision, property and estate security improvements	<b>Round 6 is focused on regeneration and renewal, would not fund the level of investment work required.</b>	<b>Would not secure funding for property improvements – ethos is for renewal and regeneration.</b>
2	Regenerate and rejuvenate our neighbourhoods	<b>Potential bid credits would not be sufficient to gain access to the round 6 programme</b>	<b>The purpose of the vehicle is to attract inward investment to fund the renewal and regeneration of non sustainable housing</b>
3	Meet the housing needs of the Borough (improve and increase the supply of affordable housing options for our tenants and residents).	<b>Predominately based on demolition of existing stock and new build – would not necessary increase stock numbers</b>	<b>Would offer the flexibility to 'pool' assets and consider wider housing needs across all locations of the Borough</b>
4	Meet the key national and local agendas (i.e. social inclusion, economic regeneration and the 'green agenda')	<b>Application would need to meet the PFI criteria rather than LA priorities.</b>	<b>The model would ensure that the Authorities broader ambitions remain central to this model.</b>
5	Rents to provide value for money (for both new and existing tenants).	<b>Rent modelling has not been undertaken</b>	<b>Would work with an RSL partner to ensure the inclusion of affordable housing on key sites.</b>
6	Tenants rights to be protected.	<b>New social housing provision would comply with 'tenants rights'</b>	<b>As a tenant of an RSL partner rights would be protected (as existing RSL tenants).</b>
7	Provide a 'local' management and presence.	<b>Modelling in this detail has not been undertaken to inform this criteria.</b>	<b>The Authority would use this criterion to determine its RSL partner.</b>
8	Ensure good communication structures with tenants.	<b>As above</b>	<b>As Above</b>

	Criteria	Option 1:	
		As an ALMO	Take back in House
9	Deliver opportunities for 'real' tenant involvement, participation and influence at all levels	As previous	As previous.
10	Ensure continuous service and quality improvement.	PFI round 6 is focused on renewal and regeneration – not service improvement.	As above